

PERFORMANCE MEASURES AND ACCOUNTABILITY COMMITTEE REPORT
Workforce Development Board Meeting
Thursday, November 18, 2021

The Performance Measures and Accountability Committee met on October 25 and November 3, 2021.

Statewide Evaluation of Service Providers Report by SMS Research and Marketing

SMS Research was contracted to conduct a statewide evaluation of service providers who provide services for the WIOA Title 1 adult, dislocated workers and youth programs at the American Job Centers. SMS' Executive Vice President Daniel Nahoopii and Assistant Project Director Ava Avila shared the objectives: (1) to measure level of performance of service provider for career and training services for WIOA Title 1 participants in accordance with federal, state and local policies; (2) to measure the extent providers are able to reach the Title 1 individuals mandated in the WIOA law; (3) to identify strengths, weaknesses, gaps; and (4) provide recommendations. SMS visited each AJC and conducted on-site interviews with service providers, county Executive Directors and key staff such as case managers. They inspected work environment, file storage and public access areas, reviewed case files, and conducted online survey with case managers and service providers.

At the Hawaii County AJC, Goodwill Industries is the service provider for adult, dislocated worker and youth programs. Observations for the youth program included: (1) limited funds but supplemented by smaller grants; (2) based in Hilo, concerns regarding service on Kona side; (3) HireNet Hawaii has not been utilized for performance tracking because of "access issues;" and (4) service provider is not co-located in the AJC. For the adult and dislocated worker programs, (1) Goodwill experienced staffing shortages and new case managers need to be trained; (2) inherited over 100 clients from previous service provider with some incomplete or missing supporting documents; (3) not enough ETPs; and (4) the HireNet Hawaii e-signature feature is being utilized and they digitized the application form. For the City and County of Honolulu/Oahu, WorkHawaii provides the services for the three programs. In the youth program, transition to virtual platform was challenging for case managers; verbal feedback from the youth is highly encouraged to improve service delivery; and co-location at the AJC provides flexibility in serving youth adults 18 and older with multiple option of services. For the adult and dislocated worker programs, it was disclosed that staff are not technologically savvy; communication and reporting guidelines are unclear; the process of coordination and integration of services by co-located partners is siloed; survey responses stated staff feels there is no teamwork; and it was noted and applauded that Oahu AJC has a dedicated room for locked cabinets securing case files.

UH Maui College is the service provider for Maui County's youth program which has a strong non-profit network, especially with the veterans community. However, it was noted that there is a poor filing system with missing supporting documents; insufficient staffing to meet the needs of the program; no transition plan in response to COVID-19; having interns conduct check-ins and case management of participants is a breach of data integrity; and the service provider is located separately from other service providers. Goodwill Industries is the service provider for the adult and dislocated worker programs. Current case managers are new to the program and still familiarizing with the programs and HireNet Hawaii; missing supporting documents in case files; the new AJC location has less foot traffic and visibility. Kauai's youth program is serviced by Hale Opio which has not enrolled any youth participants under WIOA. Due to existing barriers of at risk, foster and homeless youth, few were able to provide documentation required for enrollment; has funds for supplies and staff but no cases to monitor; not familiar with goals and priorities of WIOA law; and it was reported that staff is scared to enroll participants then being told it was done incorrectly so they are overly cautious. DLIR's Workforce Development Division is the service provider for Kauai's adult and dislocated worker programs. There are no formal process to check work of the case manager; limited funding restricts broader outreach; and partners are not located in the AJC. SMS Research preliminary recommendations include more training on HireNet Hawaii for better reporting outcomes. A final report will be available by November 30, 2021.

Statewide Evaluation of Eligible Training Providers by EDSI

Educational Data Systems, Inc. (EDSI) was contracted to conduct a statewide evaluation of eligible training providers (ETP). The training providers are companies and educational institutions that provide approved training programs that lead to industry-recognized credentials, apprenticeships, cohort-based training and career pathways. The EDSI team: Managing Director Ken Mall, Workforce Solutions Director Brian Lester and Workforce Development Consultant Wesley Garris reported the project objectives were to identify and measure: (1) level of organizational capacity of current ETPs; (2) level of quality in ETPs training programs; (3) extent to which the ETPs’ training programs are designed to meet job requirements and employment needs of employers; (4) strengths, weaknesses, and gaps in the ETPs capacity to conduct training and comply with federal, state and local policies; and (5) geographic and sector/occupational gaps in providers and programs.

Twenty-three (23) ETPs were interviewed. In May 2021 the 23 ETPs offered 187 programs with significant presence of technology and healthcare training available on Oahu and Hawaii Island. Construction, manufacturing, skilled trades, hospitality and culinary classes were also offered. Kauai has no current ETPs. In October 2021, a few more ETPs were added totaling 203 programs. The length of programs for classes ranged from 3 weeks or less to one year or over. The primary method of conducting classes were through online or distance learning (96%) due to COVID and in-person classes was at 63% and hybrid of classroom and online options at 44%.

Current State of ETPs and Programs 

October 2021 ETP List							
Island / County	# of Providers	# of Programs	IT	Healthcare	Construction, or Manufacturing, or Skilled Trade	Hospitality / Culinary	All Other
Oahu	14	146	46	41	28	5	26
Hawaii	7	49	11	32	1	0	4
Maui	4	51	11	28	2	1	8
Kauai	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Statewide*	23	203	55	75	30	6	37

- Some providers / programs listed in multiple counties; but counted once in statewide total
- 2 new providers, 2 providers removed from May list

In Program Year 2018 (July 1, 2018 to June 30, 2019) there were 536 WIOA funded participants taking classes out of the 1,428 non-WIOA students. In Program Year 2019 (July 1, 2019 to June 30, 2020), the data showed 488 WIOA funded participants out of 1,369 non-WIOA participants. The majority of the participants were enrolled in healthcare classes. The ETPs self-evaluation of understanding of reporting requirements and process was evenly spread out between low knowledge, moderate knowledge and strong knowledge of requirements. Interestingly, the ETPs self-evaluation showed that the majority were confident in their ability to meet reporting requirements. ETPs expressed challenges around communication of expectations (data content, timing, delivery), resistance to non-WIOA data sharing, and lack of University of Hawaii system

participation. ETPs found the application and renewal process mostly straightforward, however some were unclear on what explicitly qualifies as “in-demand occupations/sectors.” Most ETPs have capacity within existing classes and potential for additional cohorts if demand is present. Several ETPs expressed interest in adding other existing programs to the list or developing new program with WIOA demand. Other key findings included current programs generally of high quality, challenges of viable cohort size on smaller islands, and low use of degree level programs. Recommendations are being worked on. A final report will be available by December 31, 2021.

Link to presentation: <https://labor.hawaii.gov/wdc/performance-measures-accountability-committee-meetings-2021/>

Update on Statewide Rapid Response and Business Services

Employment Services Specialist Harrison Kuranishi provided a brief overview of the statewide rapid response and business services efforts which included several hiring events in each county. Kauai held a two-day hiring event featuring 15 employers; Oahu’s event on August 3 culminated with 28 employers and service providers participating; and Maui held a drive through hiring event; and Hawaii Island had a virtual hiring event. For the period between July 1, 2020 to June 30, 2021, there were 16 WARN letters received affecting 32,587 employees. Here is the breakdown: Oahu had 80 WARN impacting 18,572 employees; Maui had 46 WARN affecting 8,770 employees; Kauai had 20 WARN with 1,882 employees impacted; and Hawaii Island had 19 WARN affecting 3,363 employees. Mr. Kuranishi also reported for the COVID-19 Disaster Recovery grant, 22 employer worksites have been confirmed providing opportunities for 17 individuals and 7 others are going through the application process.

Link to presentation: <https://labor.hawaii.gov/wdc/files/2021/11/WDD-Updates-RR-PMAC-10.25.2021.pptx>

Joint Meeting with Maui County Workforce Development Board

On November 3, 2021, the Committee held a joint meeting with the Maui County Workforce Development Board to meet the board members and share information from the state level.

A big MAHALO to Leslie Wilkins as Chair of the Maui County Workforce Development Board and her board members for welcoming the Committee members to join their meeting and exchange information.

The Committee will be planning a joint meeting with the Hawaii County Workforce Development Board next year.